

# **Scrutiny Committee**

# **Annual Report 2017-18**

### **Introduction by Councillor Nichols - Chair of the Scrutiny Committee**



I am pleased to present the Scrutiny Committee's Annual Report 2017-18, which sets out the work undertaken by the Committee over the course of 2017-18 municipal year.

The Scrutiny Committee has met six times during 2017-18 and considered a range of different topics and issues.

I would like to express my thanks to my fellow members of the Committee for their support and continued hard work. Many people have contributed to the success of Scrutiny, including officers, external partner organisations and my thanks goes out to all of them.

### **The Scrutiny Committee**

The Scrutiny Committee membership comprised the following members during the 2017-18 municipal year:

#### 7 Members

Conservative	Labour	Independent
D Buckle	W Nichols (Chair)	D Mackay
L Casling	S Duckett (Vice Chair)	
I Chilvers		
D White		

#### The Role of the Scrutiny Committee

Scrutiny was introduced by the Local Government Act 2000.

Selby District Council operates a Leader and Executive model, where the Executive is responsible for most day-to-day decisions. The role of the Scrutiny Committee is to scrutinise decisions and performance and to hold the Leader and Executive to account.

Scrutiny's main roles are:

 To scrutinise the performance of the Council and that of its partner organisations and other agencies delivering services within the Selby District.

- To exercise the Council's statutory obligations and powers in relation to Scrutiny.
- Exercise the right of call-in of decisions and recommendations made, but not yet implemented.
- To issue reports and make recommendations, where appropriate, and in relation to any matters listed above, for consideration by the Council, Executive or the relevant Committee of the Council.

### 2017/18 Work Programme

A summary of the Committee's work over the last year is set out below.

### Conclusion, 2018-19 and the Scrutiny Review

The Scrutiny Committee fulfilled its role through its work programme in 2017-18; however, as a result of the Corporate Peer Challenge undertaken in November 2017, it was recommended that the scrutiny function at Selby should be strengthened.

The report of the Peer Review Group was considered by the Scrutiny Committee at its meeting in March 2018, and it was agreed that work to improve scrutiny at Selby should be progressed throughout the 2018-19 year.

Scrutiny training was provided by Kirklees Council in April 2018, from which a number of themes, actions and goals were identified from the work of Members present at the sessions, which were subsequently presented to the Scrutiny Working Group for consideration.

A report about the Scrutiny Review was considered by the Executive on 24 May 2018; the recommendations set out in this report were a reflection of the discussions had at the Kirklees training in April 2018 and at the meeting of the Scrutiny Working Group on 24 April 2018.

The Executive were supportive of the way forward and agreed the recommendations at their meeting on 24 May 2018.

The report will also be considered for comments and suggestions by the Scrutiny Committee at its meeting on 27 June 2018, and then by the Council in July 2018.

Councillor Wendy Nichols Chair, Scrutiny Committee



## **Scrutiny Committee - Work Programme 2017-18**

Date of Meeting	Topic	Discussion / Resolution
6 July 2017	Forward Plan	The Committee queried why the Council was funding a new roundabout for Staynor Hall when usually the funding roads and highways was the responsibility of the County Council. It was agreed a response would be sought on this.
	Corporate Performance Report Quarter 4 (January to March 2017)	The report provided an update on the delivery of the Council's Corporate Plan 2015-20 and issues raised by the Committee at the last meeting, including missed bin collections, visits to Council leisure centres, the savings target, empty homes and sickness absence.
		Concerns were also raised at the lack of progress with the Olympia Park development and cleanliness of the Leisure Centre in particular the changing rooms. The Committee suggested that it would be helpful in the future to include remedial actions and progress on delivering them in the exceptions report.
	Scrutiny Work Programme	The Committee considered the Work Programme and discussed progress on empty homes, media reports about the Selby War Memorial Hospital, Selby Leisure Centre and emergency planning arrangements.  The Committee agreed to update the work programme with the
		above comments.
28 September 2017	Programme for Growth	The report provided an update on the progress with Programme for Growth 3 (P4G3) projects.

	The Committee discussed a number of issues, including labour market challenges, nursery provision, split-shifts and public transport availability for workers at Sherburn Enterprise Park, and the Council's involvement in the expansion of Church Fenton Studios.
	Members also asked for more detail on labour market challenges in the next P4G update to the Committee and that clearer targets and outcomes be included in the P4G guidance note for Councillors to be able to better understand the outputs delivered by the programme.
	The Committee noted the content of the report.
Olympia Park Development	The report updated the Committee on the work carried out to date, and proposed next steps, to enable the delivery of Olympia Park.
	The Committee noted that unlocking the site for development was proving to be difficult, and that other options were being considered in order to make it viable for developers. A bid for Housing Infrastructure Funding (HIF) was being submitted by the Council to the Homes and Communities Agency (HCA) in order to access monies to open up the site and bring the development forward.
	Further discussion took place in relation to the report on a number of matters, including concern amongst Members that farmland would be lost to housing on some parts of the site, that there were known flooding, ground condition and contaminated land issues, that brownfield sections would be left as they were and that the number of homes that could be built would be reduced. The importance of improving cycle and pedestrian access from the Olympia Park site into Selby town centre was emphasised,

Corporate Performance F	Report for Q	The Committee referenced a past evaluation which stated that industrial use would be a more efficient and appropriate use of the land, and suggested that a further update on Olympia Park be brought back in six months' time.  The Committee noted the work carried out to date, and proposed next steps, to enable the delivery of Olympia Park, and instructed officers to bring an update back to Committee in six months' time.  The report presented to the Committee had been considered by the
2017/18		Executive at their September meeting.  The Committee noted that layout of the report had been amended following feedback from both Executive and Scrutiny.  Members expressed concerns regarding the number of reported missed bins and time taken to process new benefit claims and changes to details, and queried the reason for scaffolding erected at new affordable homes on St Joseph's Street in Tadcaster.  The Committee received and noted the report.
Leisure Annual Review		The Committee received a verbal update on issues raised by the Committee at their last meeting and on the annual review, and noted the following:  - Issues relating to cleanliness in the changing rooms had been addressed and as a result the cleaning plan had been reviewed.  - Officers had asked Inspiring Healthy Lifestyles (IHL) to actively promote the complaints procedure.

Financial Results and Budget Exceptions to 30 June 2017	<ul> <li>Footfall had improved in Selby and Tadcaster, with 1000 swimmers using the Learn to Swim programme and 24 schools using the pool at Selby. There had also been enthusiastic support for recent cycle events such as the Tour de Yorkshire.</li> <li>23 student work placements from a range of local and regional schools, colleges and universities had been hosted as well as local volunteers supporting various activities.</li> <li>The adult weight management programme had a positive impact for those involved.</li> <li>The Committee asked officers to look into a reported leak near the entrance of Selby Leisure Centre.</li> <li>The Committee noted the update.</li> <li>The report had been considered by the Executive on 7 September 2017.</li> <li>The Executive Lead Member for Finance and Resources, Councillor C Lunn, was also in attendance for this item.</li> <li>The Committee discussed the report in further detail and raised a number of points, including concerns regarding the potential move of the contact centre from Market Cross to the Civic Centre and subsequent pressure on car parking, bus station refurbishment and Selby Town Enterprise Partnership (STEP) funding.</li> <li>The Committee noted the report.</li> </ul>
---	--

	Treasury Management Monitoring Report for Q1	The report had been considered by the Executive on 7 September 2017 and set out the progress against borrowing in Quarter 1. The Executive Lead Member for Finance and Resources was in attendance for this item.  A query was raised regarding the use of £8m of affordable housing funds and whether this could be used across the whole District; Officers confirmed that it could.  The Committee noted the report.
	Scrutiny Committee Work Programme 2017-18	The Committee considered the Work Programme and Executive Forward Plan.  The Committee asked that the Council's approach to emergency planning be considered at a future meeting, that Council funded community centres be looked at again and that the scheduling of Scrutiny Committee meetings for 2018-19 be more evenly spaced throughout the municipal year.
17 October 2017	Call-In: Car Parking Strategy and Tariff Review	The Committee updated the Work Programme.  As a result of the call-in of the Executive decision taken on 19 September 2017, the Committee met to consider the Car Parking Strategy and Tariff Review.  The Committee was asked to consider the following options; to refer the decision back to the Executive for reconsideration, agree with the decision made by the Executive and take no further action or refer the decision to Council.  Five Councillors had called-in the decision because they had felt that it was contrary to the decision making principles as set out at Article 13.1 (b) and (i) of the Constitution. Of particular concern had

been the lack of clarity regarding the financial effects of changes discussed the Council meeting immediately before the Executive.

Members debated the call-in and considered the weight given to additional representations regarding free parking in Tadcaster, enforcement of the extra free hour in Tadcaster and the impact of the loss of income on the Council and the rationale behind the level of increases to parking charges in Selby due to the potential impact on the local economy and deprived areas of the town.

The Executive Lead Member for Finance and Resources explained that the two hours free parking in Selby would have had a detrimental effect on the Council's revenue and that there would be a twelve month post implementation review of any changes to the District's car parks.

The Committee noted that a new order would be required under Section 35 of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984.

The importance of scrutiny in the decision making process of the Council was emphasized; it was felt that more time and consideration should be given to scrutiny and that the tariff review and strategy should have been through pre-decision scrutiny.

The Committee referred the matter back to the Executive for reconsideration.

The Committee referred the decision back to the Executive for reconsideration for the following reasons:

1. The decision of the Executive had been taken without the full financial information and costings being presented to

		all Members at the Council meeting;
		2. The modelling information relating to the impact of not having two hours free parking in Selby, as well as an increase in tariffs in the town, was not fully taken into account;
		3. There were concerns regarding the increase in parking charges in Selby town from £1.20 to £1.50 and the potential impact on the local economy;
		4. There were concerns regarding scheme piloting and enforcement;
		5. Press releases had been published prior to the expiry of the five day call-in period that is required following an Executive decision; and
		6. The decision was taken in five minutes at a meeting of the Executive convened immediately after the Council meeting.
23 November 2017	Emergency Planning	The report explained the Council's arrangements for emergency planning and was considered alongside a presentation from NYCC's Resilience and Emergencies Team Leader and Senior Resilience and Emergencies Officer.
		Members discussed the presentation and report and raised a number if queries, such as the impact of past incidents in Selby, improvements required in the support and knowledge of the Environment Agency, the use of Selby Leisure Centre as a rest centre, communications during incidents and feedback of local

knowledge to the authorities.

The Committee asked that the presentation be offered to all Members of the Council and that Scrutiny Committee receive a twice-yearly report on all incidents dealt with by the emergency planning team. Officers were also asked to consider allowing some Members to observe a live or table top exercise, in order for them to gain an understanding of how such exercises are undertaken and managed.

#### The Committee:

- 1. Noted the Council's arrangements for emergency planning.
- 2. Circulated copies of the presentation slides to Committee Members.
- 3. Asked Officers to give the presentation to all Selby District Councillors at a future training date.
- 4. Asked Officers to circulate copies of the Elected Members' Resilience and Emergency Response Handbook 2017 to all Selby District Councillors.
- 5. Asked Officers to consider allowing Member observation at a live or table-top emergency planning exercise.
- 6. Requested a report every six months detailing all incidents dealt with by the emergency planning team at Selby District Council.

	Scrutiny Committee Work Programme 2017-18	Members considered the Committee's work programme for the rest of the 2017-18 municipal year.  The Committee recognised that recommendations from the LGA Peer Review were likely to have an impact on the work of the Committee. The Committee also requested that a report on the Police co-location to be added to the work plan.  The Committee added a report regarding the impact of the colocation of the Police at the Civic Centre to its Work Programme.
25 January 2018	Housing Development Programme 2017-20	The report updated the Committee on the Housing Development Programme 2017-20.  The Committee considered the report and raised points relating to the exemption of homes under the Selby District Housing Trust from right to buy schemes and the use of garage sites around the District for housing. Members felt that a managed approach was needed in order to avoid leaving garages vacant unnecessarily. The Committee asked for further data on the rental of Council owned garages.  The Committee noted the report and asked Officers to send data on the rental of Council owned garages to Members.
	Corporate Performance Report – Quarter 2 – 2017-18 (July to September)	data on the rental of Council owned garages to Members.  The report gave an overview of the Council's corporate performance.  Members asked questions on the report, including on the recovery of sundry debt and the time taken to re-let vacant Council homes, particularly rural bungalows which were proving harder to let. Members emphasised the need for long-term planning of homes

		and asked that this matter be fed into the work of the Housing
		Development Programme.
		The Committee noted the report.
	cial Results and Budget Exceptions	The report updated the Committee on the Council's financial results
Report	t to 30 September	and budget exceptions.
		Members asked if an impact report on the effect of the Tour de Yorkshire Event on Selby District could be bought to a future meeting of the Committee for consideration; the Committee
		understood that some traders in Tadcaster were still struggling and it was reported that some business had even seen a fall in profits as a result of the Tour de Yorkshire.
		Members raised other issues including delays to the Lifeline system at St Wilfrid's Court, access to employment in the District, particularly around matching local job-seekers to local jobs in areas such as Sherburn, and transport for employment.
		The Committee noted the contents of the report, asked that a report on the impact of the Tour de Yorkshire on Selby District and its businesses be bought to the Committee at a later date, and requested further information on the delay to upgrades of the Lifeline System at St Wilfrid's Court.
Treasu for Q2	iry Management Monitoring Report	The report apprised the Committee on the Council's treasury management activities for the 6 month period 1 April 2017 to 30 September 2017 and presented performance against the Prudential Indicators.
		The Committee were pleased to note that the pension deficit had been paid off in total last year, and that at present, the North

	Yorkshire Pension Fund was funded at 107%, which was a vast improvement on 30% a few years ago.
	The Committee noted the report.
North Yorkshire Children's and North Yorkshire Safeguarding Adults Board Annual Reports 2016-17	The report gave details of the annual reports for the North Yorkshire Children's and North Yorkshire Safeguarding Adults Boards.
	The Committee noted that from April 2018 there would be further responsibilities for District Councils to consider, in conjunction with County Councils.
	The Committee noted the annual reports.
Scrutiny Committee Work Programme 2017-18 and 2018-19	Members considered the Committee's work programme for the rest of the 2017-18 municipal year and the draft plan for 2018-19.
	The Committee requested that Nigel Adams MP be invited to attend a future meeting, and that it would be appropriate for theme to consider the report on the findings of the LGA Peer Review, with a particular focus on scrutiny.
	It was also agreed that the Car Parking Strategy and Tariff Review, which had been considered as a call-in item in October 2017, should come back to Committee in order for the impact of the revised tariffs to be examined following monitoring for the trial period of 6 to 12 months.
	It was also agreed that should the co-location of the Police at the Council Offices was delayed, the matter should be moved further down the Committee's work programme for 2018/19.

		The Committee noted the work programme for 2017/18 and the draft work programme for 2018/19, asked the Democratic Services Officer to invite Nigel Adams MP to a future meeting, added to the work programme for 2018/19 the report on the findings of the LGA Peer Review and the Car Parking Strategy and Tariff Review, and agreed that should the co-location with the Police at the Council Offices be delayed, the matter be moved further down the Committee's work programme for 2018/19.
22 March 2018	Corporate Performance Q3 – 2017/18 (October to December)	The Committee to note the contents and make any comments on the Council's corporate performance.  Members expressed concern around some homes in the District being left empty for too long and the turnaround times for some Council properties being longer than expected due to the amount of work needed to bring some homes up to standard once previous
		tenants left the properties.  Members were pleased to see planning application targets being met, but were troubled by the decline in numbers of people attending leisure centres. It was suggested by the Committee that there needed to be more evidence of publicity and marketing for the leisure centres.
		Officers confirmed that the recorded accidents at work that had been reported were relatively minor, and that a number of managers had been sent on intensive safety courses in order to improve safety in the workplace.  The Committee noted the report and asked Officers to look into the issue of empty properties at Barley Fields in Barlby.

Corporate Peer Challenge - Feedback an Next Steps	The Committee were asked to consider the contents and make comments on the Corporate Peer Challenge, with a particular focus on the Peer Challenge's recommendations around strengthening and improving scrutiny at Selby.
	The Committee discussed the matter in detail, and made the following points:
	- Members requested more details regarding the plans for reviewing scrutiny at Selby, and emphasised the importance of the Committee being involved in the work.
	- The Committee felt that as a result of there being no dedicated Scrutiny Officer, scrutiny at Selby suffered as a result.
	- There were concerns around availability for scrutiny training arranged for 12 April 2018 by Kirklees Council, and that the principles of scrutiny at bigger authorities like Kirklees were fundamentally different to those at Selby, and as such, training delivered by a large authority may not be relevant.
	- The Executive should ask Scrutiny to look at their work before final decisions are made, i.e. pre-scrutiny on matters such as the Car Parking Strategy, and that this would help to improve the transparency of Executive decision making.
	- The Committee noted that the upcoming mid-term refresh of the Corporate Plan could be used as a framework by Scrutiny in order to identify upcoming Executive work that they might wish to examine further.

Financial Results and Budget Exceptions Report to 31 December 2017  The Committee were asked to note the contents and make comments on the Council's financial results and budget exception.  Members raised a number of queries with Officers at the meet including the need for replacement ticket machines at the budget exception. Micklegate car park in Selby, the underspend of the disal facilities grant, remedial work on the culvert at Portholme Roabout which Members requested an update due to the risk flooding, and the progress of the plans for co-location with Police at the Council Offices.		which the Committee's work could be developed, such as community visits, scrutinising across different Council departments and examining issues of local concern for residents.  The Committee were asked to note the contents and make any comments on the Council's financial results and budget exceptions.  Members raised a number of queries with Officers at the meeting, including the need for replacement ticket machines at the back Micklegate car park in Selby, the underspend of the disabled facilities grant, remedial work on the culvert at Portholme Road, about which Members requested an update due to the risk of flooding, and the progress of the plans for co-location with the Police at the Council Offices.  The Committee noted the report and asked Officers to update

	The Committee noted the report.
Programme for Growth Update	The Committee were asked to discuss the content and provide comments on the progress of the P4G projects.
	The Committee asked questions of Officers and raised a number of issues for discussion, including P4G's links to the Visitor Economy Strategy and tourism in the District and the importance of effective street cleaning, fly tipping recovery and waste management on improving the local area.
	The Committee noted the report and agreed to add to the Scrutiny Committee's work programme for 2018/19 consideration of the changes made to the Programme for Growth as part of the Corporate Plan refresh, and as a response to the LGA Peer Challenge recommendations.
Olympia Park – Update on Progress and Next Steps	The Committee were asked to note the work carried out to date, and proposed next steps to enable the delivery of Olympia Park.
	The Committee were pleased to note that £8.9m in funding had been awarded to the Council by Homes England, following a successful bid to the Housing Infrastructure Fund by Officers. The funding would be released to the Council in summer 2018, and would have to be committed for spending by 2021. There had already been meaningful engagement with the site's landowners, but equally as important was the community's involvement in the plans for the site.
	Members were pleased to see works being started on the site to remove rubble, and asked that the 'new' primary school mentioned in the report be referred to in future as the 're-sited' school.

	The Committee noted the work carried out to date and asked that in future reports the proposed primary school n the site be referred to as the 're-sited' school.
Tour de Yorkshire 2017	The Committee were asked note the content and consider future involvement in shaping the Council's approach to managing major cycle events in the District.  The Committee were supportive of events and initiatives to promote the District and tourism in the area, and felt that having the start or finish of a major cycling event in the District would always be a big draw for local people and visitors from outside the area.  Members noted that whilst it was hard to prove the direct economic benefit of the event to the Selby District, the overall benefit for Yorkshire, the way in which the profile of the area was raised and
	the legacy it provided were certainly evident and very important. The Tour de Yorkshire had inspired other community events such as the Sherburn Food and Craft Festival, which thousands of people attended.
	Members suggested that key to making the most of future cycling events was ensuring that the local communities were engaged and involved, and that subsequent events inspired by them were sustainable. The Committee agreed that the Council's approach to forthcoming Tour de Yorkshire events be explored at a future meeting. Officers also suggested the Council's Visitor Economy Strategy as a topic for consideration at a future meeting of the Committee in 2018/19.
	The Committee noted the report, expressed its support for future cycling events in the District and resolved to consider the Council's approach to forthcoming Tour de Yorkshire

			events in the District and the Council's Visitor Economy Strategy at future meetings of the Committee in 2018/19.
Scrutiny Committee 2017/18 and 2018/19	Work	Programme	The Committee considered the work plan for the remainder of the 2017/18 municipal year and the draft plan for 2018/19.
			Members noted the following:
			- That Nigel Adams MP had been invited to a future meeting of the Committee, most likely in September, subject to final confirmation from his office.
			- That the review of the Car Parking Strategy and tariffs was on the Committee's work programme for later in the 2018/19 year, to tie in with the Executive's review of the arrangements following a year of operation.
			- That the review of Council Funded Community Centres would be kept under review on the work programme and allocated a specific date when appropriate.
			The Committee indicated that they would be interested to hear from the Chair of the North Yorkshire Police and Crime Panel, and that he should be invited to a future meeting.
			It was also suggested that transport be considered as a topic for a future meeting, and that a provisional meeting date be used for this purpose. Representatives from Northern Rail, Arriva and Leeds City Region would be invited to the meeting.
			The Committee noted the draft work plan for 2018/19, the attendance of Nigel Adams MP at a future meeting (September

TBC), that the issue of Council Funded Community Centres
would be allocated a specific meeting date later in the year,
that the Chair of the North Yorkshire Police and Crime Panel
would be invited to a future meeting and that the topic of
transport in the District would be added to the work
programme for 2018/19.